

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
HEARING MINUTES
MARCH 8, 2012**

Commissioners

Scott Winnette, Chairman (not present)
Robert Jones, Vice Chairman
Gary Baker
Shawn Burns
Stephen Parnes
Tim Wesolek
Brian Dylus, Alternate (not present)

Aldermanic Representative

Michael O'Connor

Staff

Lisa Mroszczyk Murphy, Historic Preservation Planner
Christina Martinkosky, Historic Preservation Planner (not present)
Scott Waxter, Assistant City Attorney
Matt Davis, Manager of Comprehensive Planning
Shannon Albaugh, HPC Administrative Assistant (not present)

I. Call to Order

Mr. Jones called the meeting to order at 6:00 P.M. He stated that the technical qualifications of the Commission and the staff are on file with the City of Frederick and are made a part of each and every case before the Commission. He also noted that the Frederick City Historic Preservation Commission uses the Guidelines adopted by the Mayor and Board of Aldermen and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation published by the U. S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, and these Guidelines are made a part of each and every case. All cases were duly advertised in the Frederick News Post in accordance with Section 301 of the Land Management Code.

Announcements

Ms. Murphy announced that the HPC along with the Frederick County Landmarks Foundation and the African American Cultural Resources Heritage Society will be co-hosting a lecture by C. Fraiser Smith who wrote *Here Jim Crow Lies: Civil Rights in Maryland*. It will be held in the City Hall Board Room Wednesday March 14, 2012 starting at 7:00 PM. It is free and open to the public.

II. Approval of Minutes

1. February 23, 2012 Hearing/Workshop Minutes

Motion: Tim Wesolek moved to approve the February 23, 2012 hearing and workshop minutes as written.
Second: Shawn Burns
Vote: 5 - 0

II. HPC Business

2. Administrative Approval Report

IV. Consent Items

a. Cases to be Approved

b. Cases to be Continued

V. Cases to be Heard

3. HPC12-42

Construct 3 story addition
Lisa Mroszczyk Murphy

116-118 E. Patrick Street

Anson Brooks Smith
Norman Morin, Jr., agent

Staff Presentation

Ms. Murphy entered the entire staff report into the record and stated that the applicant is seeking amendments to a previous approval (HPC10-58) for a third story addition on an existing two story wing and a three story addition at the rear of that wing to address code requirements. The primary structure is a three-story, mid-nineteenth century contributing commercial building. Key amendments include:

- Substituting a courtyard in place of the glass storefront enclosure at the first floor wing;
- Incorporating a stair tower and corridor
- Eliminating the proposed side porches and exterior stairs
- Reducing the width of the third story addition so that it no longer extends beyond the historic wing;
- Relocating the proposed condensing units from the roof to the ground at the rear of the building;
- Removal of the rear first floor of the historic frame building; and
- Temporary removal and reinstallation of the first floor storefront of the historic frame building.

Smooth fiber cement and standing seam metal roofing were approved as materials in the original application. Brick was also generally approved in the original application but the specific brick product has been identified in this application. The only additional material proposed in this amendment is aluminum clad wood windows with simulated divided lights.

Applicant Presentation

Norm Morin, with Bushey Feight Morin Architects, Inc., stated that they have updated the Pella window which they will submit for review and they also brought an Eagle window. He stated the nice thing about the Eagle window is it has an extruded aluminum on the exterior which means it has a lot more of an advanced profile, similar to actual wood. He explained that the spacer bar is included, the mulls are attached, the extruded aluminum gives you more strength and it also comes in a variety of shapes or brick molds that can be attached. Mr. Morin added that the brick they chose is a nice red color which is common in Frederick and it is a brick that is regionally made.

Commission Questioning/Discussion

Mr. Jones asked if they were still proposing the Talon window. Mr. Morin answered yes, that would be their top choice.

Mr. Baker asked what size muntin they were planning on using. Mr. Morin agreed that it would be 5/8”.

Mr. Baker asked what type of brick pattern would be used. Mr. Morin answered a running bond. Mr. Morin added that they show stacked soldier courses because they felt it articulated the façade a little bit more and gave it some definition. Mr. Baker asked if the mortar was something they were planning on working out with staff since it was not noted on the plans. Mr. Morin answered yes. Mr. Baker stated that he had a concern with the crisp cut look of the brick because it is not totally compatible with what is there. Mr. Jones stated that the brick, soldier coursing, and Hardi-Plank made the distinction between the proposed addition and the existing structure. Mr. Baker asked if the brick sills would have a slope or overhang. Mr. Morin answered yes, they would be sloped to avoid having water trapped between the fiber cement siding and the row lock. He added that he would work with staff to approve final brick and mortar selections.

Mr. Baker stated that the windows they show in the plans now are a much better improvement over what was talked about before but he asked if they studied the option of making the tail end look like a sleeping porch. Mr. Morin answered that the windows were laid out according to the interior space. The bays are defined with the soldier courses and they needed the stronger corners for structural reasons.

Mr. Wesolek stated that he was happy with the work they have done and the changes that have been made. He added that this will be an excellent addition to the Historic District.

Mr. Parnes stated that they have seen this application at a couple workshops in which they worked out the issues and the applicant came back with those concerns addressed.

Public Comment – There was no public comment.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of the application as consistent with the *Frederick Town Historic District Design Guidelines* as further described in this report with the following conditions:

- The windows feature simulated divided lights with permanently affixed muntins and a spacer bar.
- All other materials not identified at this time, such as light fixtures, are to be submitted for staff approval prior to applying for permits.

Materials to be approved to include:

- Drawings D1.1, A1.1, A3.1, A4.1 and A5.1 dated February 29, 2012
- Continental Brick Company Std 406 Modular brick

Motion: **Tim Wesolek moved to approve this application because it meets with the Guidelines that are set out by the Historic District with the following conditions:**

- **The windows features once selected will be approved by staff.**
- **All other materials not identified at this time, such as light fixtures, will be submitted for staff approval prior to applying for permits.**
- **The type and color of the mortar will be submitted for staff approval.**
- **There is to be a running bond on the corners of the building.**

The materials to be approved include:

- **Drawings D1.1, A1.1, A3.1, A4.1 and A5.1, dated February 29, 2012**
- **Continental Brick Company Std 406 Modular brick**

Second: **Shawn Burns**

Vote: **4 - 0**

4. HPC12-65
Replace double doors at side entrance

8 W. 2nd Street

Helen Smith

*Lisa Mroszczyk Murphy***Staff Presentation**

Ms. Murphy entered the entire staff report into the record and stated that this application concerns the replacement of paneled wood double-leaf doors on a contributing resource with flush steel doors. The existing frame and sill will also be removed. The doors are located on the west side of an addition that was constructed in 1927. The church was originally constructed in 1900.

Applicant Presentation

Helen Smith, Reverend at Centennial United Methodist Church, stated that they appreciated the support from staff for the replacement of the doors. She added that they wanted to clarify that the cast stone sill will remain since the replacement doors they are proposing will not require that the sill be tampered with at all. She went on to say that in the two weeks provided to them from the continuance, staff provided them with some suggestions of where to look for the possibility of wood doors. They did some research and came across two different types of wood doors that may work. Reverend Smith added that they find themselves in the midst of being part of the community of downtown and they want to be able to serve the citizens each week with their safety and security in mind, particularly the ones who volunteer. She went on to say that they would respectfully ask for the use of steel doors mainly for security and safety.

Mark Disney, member of Centennial United Methodist Church, stated that he talked to the manufacturers of the door and they could get some stamps so they would not be flush doors. He added that they would probably be six panel doors so there is an option to get some profile in the doors.

Commission Questioning/Discussion

Mr. Wesolek asked if they would still rather go with the steel doors even though they found wood doors that would work. Reverend Smith answered yes.

Mr. Jones stated that staff hit the nail on the head in reference to the replacement of the doors being wood. He added that in his opinion the building's overall design and integrity would be in jeopardy if they moved towards metal or another material. He went on to say that he would have to go with the Frederick Town Historic District Design Guidelines in reference to this application.

Mr. Parnes asked the other Commissioners what their thoughts were on having the small window in the door so they are able to see who is at the door before opening it. Mr. Baker stated that he did not think they were essential and it would not contribute to the overall design. He added that if the door is a solid wood plank door there would need to be some molding around the window and they have no specs on the glass that would be in the window if it were approved. He went onto say that he would like to see a resubmission of a better drawings with a better proportioned glazing system and a defined glazing of either clear glass or wire glass.

Mr. Wesolek stated that he was all for them installing the steel doors with a window because you cannot see the doors from the street. He went on to say that he understood the steel doors would not be in keeping with Guidelines but for the service they provide and the location, he felt it would be safer for the people that use the building to go with the steel doors.

Mr. Parnes stated that they have contributing resources that are not visible throughout this entire historic district and as much as he is concerned with security and safety, they would be violating the Guidelines if they were to approve this application just because it is not absolutely visible from the street.

Mr. Burns stated that because of the area where the doors are located is part of an addition and since they are not original to the building he had no concerns with the steel doors.

Mr. Baker asked if they preferred the square or long rectangle windows proposed with the steel doors. Mr.

Disney answered that the elongated one would be their preference so it would be easier for people to see out of.

Mr. Jones stated that he has seen wood doors that could work just as well. He went on to say that it states in the Frederick Town Historic District Design Guidelines “If the original door no longer exists and the documentation is not available to substitute the appearance of the original door the new door must be compatible with the period and style of the building. All replacement doors must fit into the original opening in the same manner as the original door.”

Public Comment

Frank Clements, member of Centennial United Methodist Church, stated that the issue with all of this is the fact that there is a security issue and you cannot see the doors from the street. He added that once they are painted unless you go up and scratch the paint off you would never know they were metal or wood. He stated that there is a security issue back there and the police have been called to the site approximately 45 times in the last three years. He went on to say that they are the church in Frederick County that is serving the people that no church serves.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends the Commission approve the replacement of the doors with the condition that the replacements match the existing in design and material. Staff also recommends in-kind replacement of the frame.

Staff recommends the Commission deny the replacement of the cast stone sill because it is not damaged or deteriorated and because cast stone sills are characteristic features throughout the building.

After a tie vote was taken Mr. Jones stated that they would need to continue this case to the next scheduled hearing since more Commissioners will be present and they will be able to break the tie vote.

Motion: **Shawn Burns moved to continue this case to the March 22, 2012 hearing.**
Second: **Tim Wesolek**
Vote: **4 - 0**

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 7:45 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

Shannon Albaugh,
Administrative Assistant